



## **REGENERATION AND ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD AT PENALLTA HOUSE, YSTRAD MYNACH ON  
TUESDAY, 15TH MAY 2018 AT 5.30 P.M.**

---

**PRESENT:**

Councillor D.T. Davies - Chair  
Mrs C. Forehead - Vice-Chair

**Councillors:**

J. Bevan, C. Elsbury, R.W. Gough, A. Hussey, S. Kent, J. Scriven, G. Simmonds, A. Whitcombe, T.J. Williams, W. Williams, B. Zaplatynski

**Cabinet Members:**

N. George (Neighbourhood Services), S. Morgan (Economy, Infrastructure, Sustainability and Wellbeing of Future Generations Champion), Mrs E. Stenner (Environment and Public Protection)

**Together with:**

M.S. Williams (Interim Corporate Director of Communities), M. Lloyd (Head of Infrastructure), T. Llewelyn (Senior Assistant Engineer), D. Whetter (Interim Head of Regeneration), C. Evans (Interim Scrutiny Officer), L. Lane (Interim Monitoring Officer) and R. Barrett (Committee Services Officer)

### **1. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chair welcomed Members to the first Scrutiny Committee meeting of the new financial year and referred to the challenges that lay ahead.

The Scrutiny Committee were advised that Mr Dave Whetter was due to retire at the end of the month. Members placed on record their thanks to Mr Whetter for his many years of service, and in particular his commitment in carrying out the role of Interim Head of Regeneration, and wished him well in his retirement.

Mr Marcus Lloyd was also congratulated on his recent appointment to the post of Head of Infrastructure.

### **2. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors A.G. Higgs, Ms P. Leonard and J. Ridgewell.

### **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest received at the commencement or during the course of the meeting.

### **4. MINUTES - 27TH MARCH 2018**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the Regeneration and Environment Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 27th March 2018 (minute nos. 1 - 11) be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

### **5. CALL-IN PROCEDURE**

There had been no matters referred to the Scrutiny Committee in accordance with the call-in procedure.

### **6. REPORT OF THE CABINET MEMBERS**

The Scrutiny Committee noted the contents of the reports from Councillors, Mrs E. Stenner, S. Morgan and N. George which provided an update on their respective portfolios, and had been circulated to Members in advance of the meeting.

The report from Councillor Mrs E. Stenner (Cabinet Member for Environment and Public Protection) updated Members on developments across Public Protection, which was newly returned to the remit of the Regeneration and Environment Scrutiny Committee. The update included the outcome of a recent visit by the Deputy Registrar to the Council's Register Office, recent action taken by the Environmental Health Team, and Catering's pilot trial of the cashless system in 4 primary schools.

Members were also updated regarding developments across Planning, including progress in respect of the Strategic Development Plan, and the latest on the proposal to dis-allow paragraph 6.2 of TAN 1. In response to a query, The Cabinet Member explained that this is good news for the Authority because it indicates that Welsh Government are acknowledging the planning issues faced by local authorities in respect of the requirement for a 5-year housing land supply. In addition, Councillor Stenner congratulated Rhian Kyte on her appointment as Head of Regeneration and Planning and thanked Tim Stephens for managing the Planning Service on an interim basis.

The report from Councillor S. Morgan (Deputy Leader and Cabinet Member for Economy, Infrastructure and Sustainability) congratulated Rhian Kyte on her appointment to Head of Regeneration and Planning and Marcus Lloyd to his appointment as Head of Infrastructure. Councillor Morgan also placed on record his thanks to Dave Whetter for carrying out the role of Interim Head of Regeneration. The report provided an update on developments across the proposed Regeneration Project Board, Local Tourism, the Engineering Projects Group, Highway Operations Group, and Transportation Engineering Group.

A Member referred to the establishment of the Regeneration Project Board (which will be tasked to identify the Council's priority strategic regeneration projects and oversee their progress and delivery via externally sourced funding) and expressed a need for this to include Councillor representatives from the northern end of the county borough. It was confirmed that the Cabinet Member would arrange to discuss this further with the Member following the meeting.

The report from Councillor N. George (Cabinet Member for Neighbourhood Services)

advised Members of the forthcoming relocation of Parks and Bereavement Services to Bargoed, and provided an update on the Scrutiny Street Scene and Waste Review Working Groups. The Cabinet Member referred to the achievements by Caerphilly athletes in the recent Commonwealth Games and congratulated Hendredenny Park Primary on winning the Sport Caerphilly football World Cup event. He also reminded Members of the annual Caerphilly 10K race taking place on Sunday 20th May 2018, with almost 2500 entries expected this year for the main race and 800 entries for the 2K race.

The Cabinet Members were thanked for their reports.

## **7. DEFERMENT OF REPORT - REVIEW OF TOWN CENTRE MANAGEMENT MODEL**

In view of a number of matters requiring clarification, it was unanimously agreed that consideration of Agenda Item No. 8 (Review of Town Centre Management Model) be deferred to a future meeting of the Scrutiny Committee.

## **8. REGENERATION AND ENVIRONMENT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE FORWARD WORK PROGRAMME**

Charlotte Evans (Interim Scrutiny Officer) presented the report, which outlined details of the Regeneration and Environment Scrutiny Committee Forward Work Programme (FWP) for the period May to July 2018. The Scrutiny Committee were asked to consider the FWP alongside the Cabinet Work Programme as appended to the report and suggest any changes prior to it being finalised and published on the Council's website.

Members were reminded that a workshop to consider and agree the Committee's forward work programme for the year ahead has been arranged for 24th May 2018 and were encouraged to make every effort to attend.

Clarification was sought on how reports for the FWP are generated and it was explained that this comprises a mix of Officer-led items and Members requests, which are then considered for prioritisation and inclusion by the Scrutiny Committee. A Member referred to his previous request for a report in relation to child poverty and was advised that following consideration at that time, it had been determined that the topic did not fall under the remit of the Regeneration and Environment Scrutiny Committee and that the report request should be made to the Health, Social Care and Wellbeing Scrutiny Committee.

Reference was made to the deferment of the Town Centre Management Model report and it was agreed that this be rescheduled for 26th June 2018. In view of this change, the Scrutiny Committee agreed that the Town Centre Events Programme report scheduled for 26th June 2018 be moved to 30th October 2018.

Subject to the foregoing amendments, it was unanimously agreed that the revised Forward Work Programme be published on the Council's website.

## **9. CABINET REPORTS**

None of the Cabinet reports listed on the agenda had been called forward for discussion at the meeting.

## **REPORTS OF OFFICERS**

Consideration was given to the following report.

## 10. FUTURE LIGHTING AND ENERGY SAVINGS PROPOSALS

Marcus Lloyd (Head of Infrastructure) presented the report, which outlined the options available to achieve street lighting energy savings that could contribute to the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) and mitigate energy cost increases and carbon reduction savings. The views and comments of the Scrutiny Committee were sought on the options contained within the report, prior to its presentation to Cabinet.

Members were reminded of the energy efficiency options previously implemented in respect of street lighting, including part-night lighting, dimming measures and retro-fitting of LED bulbs to a number of units. These energy-saving measures have accounted for annual savings in excess of £500k and carbon footprint reductions of 1950 tonnes of CO<sub>2</sub>

The report outlined further energy saving options to meet the requirements for the 2017-22 MTFP, which will in turn provide carbon reduction savings that will contribute to the Authority's carbon reduction commitment. The report also highlighted the discontinuation of the manufacture of low pressure sodium (SOX) lanterns and the implications for the Authority. Officers emphasised that due to continued energy cost increases (with the total cost for 2018/19 yet to be confirmed and the price expected to rise again) and the discontinuation of these lanterns, "do nothing" is not an option that can be considered. Members were reminded that there is no statutory requirement on local authorities to provide public lighting and that although The Highways Act 1980 (Sections 97 & 98) empowers local authorities to light roads, it does not place a duty to do so.

Members were therefore asked to consider four viable proposals as set out in the report: (1) convert all lanterns to LED; (2) following LED conversion extend existing inter-urban route/connecting roads part night lighting; (3) following conversion to LED all lighting to be part night lit except junctions and major town centres; (4) all lighting to be permanently switched off except junctions and major town centres. Each option highlighted the number of units affected, the implementation cost, the CO<sub>2</sub> savings in tonnes, energy savings in kWh, and annual savings.

It was explained that in the views of Officers, a permanent switch off was not an option that Members would probably find acceptable and that the most beneficial approach would be to structure any proposed changes in a phased approach as follows:-

**Phase 1** - progress a wholesale conversion of the street lighting stock to LED lanterns. This would meet the Salix funding requirements to achieve a pay back within 7 years and would be implemented over a time period of approximately 45 months.

**Phase 2** - Extend part night lighting on inter urban routes to include connecting roads in towns and villages. This would take 4 months to implement but if undertaken at the same time as Phase 1, the timeframe of 45 months could still be achieved.

**Phase 3** - part night light the whole of the stock, with the exclusion of junctions, conflict areas and major town centres. Part night lighting would operate between the hours of midnight and 05.30GMT. This would take 22 months to implement fully but if undertaken at the same time as Phase 1, the 45 months implementation would not need to be extended.

Supplementary information which had been circulated to Members in advance (Appendix 2) was also tabled at the meeting. The document outlined the effects of changes in street lighting provision and referred to a 2015 LANTERNS report (Local Authority collaborators National Evaluation of Reduced Night-time Streetlight) which analysed data from 62 authorities with lighting measures similar to those both utilised and proposed by Caerphilly. Additionally, the document also cited findings from Lincolnshire and Surrey police forces regarding part-night lighting and levels of crime. Overall, the document concluded that there does not appear to be any significant increase in either road traffic

collisions or crime as a result of changes in street lighting provision.

It was noted that a wider consultation process will need to be considered before the implementation of any of the listed street lighting proposals are progressed.

In response to Members' queries relating to an option for a Central Management System and dimming options, Officers provided further information in respect of the initial investment required to implement the proposals, the annual savings that would be achieved, and the payback period to achieve these savings. It was explained that these savings would be fully realised across the next 20 years. Members expressed concerns regarding the rationalisation of services and of the potential safety implications that part-night lighting could have for residents, in particular elderly people or those living in remote locations.

Following consideration of the report, it was moved and seconded that the Phase 1 approach be supported and the Phase 3 approach not be supported. By a show of hands, this was unanimously agreed.

Discussion took place regarding the Phase 2 proposal and Members sought clarification on specific locations that could be affected by the proposal to extend part-night lighting on inter-urban routes to include connecting roads in towns and villages. It was acknowledged that all Members would have concerns about how the proposals would impact on their particular ward, and the Chair expressed a need for greater detail to be provided in this regard before the proposal could be considered. Following discussion on whether this proposal could be deferred, it was unanimously agreed that the reservations and concerns of the Scrutiny Committee regarding the implementation of Phase 2 (in view of the need for more detailed information of the potential impact across each ward) be relayed to Cabinet.

It was therefore RECOMMENDED to Cabinet that for the reasons contained therein:-

- (i) the Phase 1 approach to progress a wholesale conversion of the street lighting stock to LED lanterns be implemented;
- (ii) the Phase 2 approach to extend part-night lighting on inter-urban routes to include connecting roads in towns and village not be supported, pending further specifics on the locations that would be affected;
- (iii) the Phase 3 approach to part night light the whole of the stock from midnight to 05.30am, with the exclusion of junctions, conflict areas, and major town centres, not be supported.

The meeting closed at 6.20 p.m.

Approved as a correct record and subject to any amendments or corrections agreed and recorded in the minutes of the meeting held on 26th June 2018, they were signed by the Chair.

---

CHAIR